

Indonesian Consumers and The Green Marketing of Eco-Friendly Personal Care Products

Andrea Renina Sudirja, Bennett Aditya Sidik, Rudy Handoko, Alavi Ali

Program Studi Branding, Sekolah Bisnis dan Ekonomi, Universitas Prasetiya Mulya, BSD City Kavling Edutown L.1, Jl. BSD Raya Utama, Tangerang 15339, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

Keyword:

Green Marketing, Greenwashing, Green Consumption, Purchase Intention, Consumer Perception.

This qualitative phenomenological study aims to explore the perceptions of Indonesian consumers towards eco-friendly personal care products and their attitudes towards green marketing strategies, particularly focusing on Love Beauty and Planet, a brand operating under a multinational company. To gather primary insights, this research conducts focus group discussions targeting two different age groups, namely millennials and Gen Z, who actively purchase and consume eco-friendly personal care products through various platforms such as e-commerce and offline stores, while being active users of popular social media platforms. By utilizing this approach, the study aims to provide valuable insights into consumers' perceptions and attitudes towards eco-friendly personal care products and the effectiveness of green marketing strategies employed by brands like Love Beauty and Planet

Kata kunci:

Pemasaran Hijau,
Pencucian hijau,
Konsumsi ramah lingkungan,
Niat Membeli,
Persepsi Konsumen.

SARI PATI

Penelitian fenomenologi kualitatif ini bertujuan untuk menggali persepsi konsumen Indonesia terhadap produk perawatan pribadi ramah lingkungan dan sikap mereka terhadap strategi pemasaran hijau, dengan fokus khusus pada Love Beauty and Planet, merek yang beroperasi di bawah perusahaan multinasional. Penelitian ini memberikan wawasan berharga tentang faktor-faktor yang mendorong niat beli konsumen. Untuk mengumpulkan wawasan utama, penelitian ini melakukan diskusi kelompok fokus (FGD) yang menargetkan dua kelompok usia yang berbeda, yaitu Gen-Z dan millennial, yang secara aktif membeli dan menggunakan produk perawatan pribadi ramah lingkungan melalui berbagai platform seperti e-commerce dan toko fisik, sambil menjadi pengguna aktif platform media sosial populer. Dengan menggunakan pendekatan ini, penelitian ini bermaksud memberikan wawasan berharga tentang persepsi dan sikap konsumen terhadap produk perawatan pribadi ramah lingkungan dan efektivitas strategi green marketing yang digunakan oleh merek seperti Love Beauty and Planet.

Corresponding Author:
andrea.sudirja@student.
pmsbe.ac.id

Copyright © 2023 by Authors,
Published by KBI.
This is an open access article
under the CC BY-SA License



INTRODUCTION

Green consumption is an area of focus that has surged as consumers become increasingly concerned about the impact of their consumption in regards to the environment, and due to the increase of green consumption, companies have been implementing green marketing (Nguyen et al., 2019), in which one of its strategies include green claims. However, with the increase in the implementation of green marketing strategies by companies and brands, greenwashing emerges as products with green claims are an important element of consumers who practice green consumption, this is due the offering of consumers being enabled to align and fulfill their environmental values and beliefs through a product or service and it has been a global phenomenon. (Atkinson & Kim, 2014). This research also focuses on personal care products since one of the consumer markets with the quickest rate of growth in Indonesia is the beauty and personal care industry, which is primarily driven by the cosmetics and skin care sectors (Statista, 2020). In addition to this statement, according to Aggarwal and Kadyan (2014), the personal care sector is the highest in terms of greenwashing with 62%. The purpose of this study is to examine the consumers' perspective and attitudes towards green marketing and greenwashing and then understanding the thoughts and factors that would then build and shape their perception in purchasing eco-friendly personal care products. Furthermore, this research uses Love Beauty and Planet as a case study brand.

Love Beauty and Planet prides itself on "5 labors of love": first being powerful and passionate in which their beauty products are packed in 100% recyclable bottles, second being "fast and fabulous" in which they produce fast-rinsing, water-efficient conditioners, third

being naturally sourced ingredients, having their products all vegan, fourth being having ethically-sourced essential oils for its product fragrance, and fifth being carbon conscious. While Love Beauty and Planet is indeed a personal care brand that reflects the brand's care and consciousness to the environment such as ethically sourcing their ingredients, additionally being PETA certified and cruelty-free, it is stated on the official website that "while most of our products are PCR (Post-Consumer Recycled), a handful of our plastics aren't - our caps being one if them." Which makes it ambiguous to consumers about their claims of their products being 100% recyclable.

Another ambiguity would be the fact that Love Beauty and Planet is under parent company, Unilever which ironically is known for its contributions to environmental problems, mainly waste from packaging. Prigi Arisandi, the Executive Director of ECOTON or the Ecological Observation and Wetlands Conservations stated that Unilever placed as one of the top 3 "corporate polluters" that contributes to pollution in several big cities due to its fragments from the products' plastic packaging. In addition, Muharram Atha Rasyadi being the Urban People Power Campaigner of Greenpeace Indonesia stated that despite Greenpeace's requests to Unilever and the Ministry of Environment and Forestry in sharing their Waste Reduction Roadmap, it is unfortunate that neither are made publicly accessible.

There is a lack of qualitative research on how consumers perceive eco-friendly personal care products in Indonesia and their attitudes towards the greenwashing phenomenon, and that limited research has been done towards greenwashing (Aji and Sutikno, 2015). This study aims to explore the

perceptions of consumers towards the green marketing strategies of eco-friendly personal care products, and addresses the following questions:

1. How do young consumers perceive eco-friendly personal care products such as Love Beauty and Planet, and what factors lead to their preference and purchase intention towards eco-friendly personal care products?
2. How do consumers perceive the brand's green marketing communication strategies, especially Love Beauty and Planet being under a multinational FMCG company?
3. How consistent do consumer's eco-consciousness reflect on their purchase and consumption of Love Beauty and Planet?
4. Is greenwashing a crucial factor in purchasing decisions of personal care products?
5. How can Love Beauty and Planet further improve their green marketing communication as their market development strategy for their beauty and personal care sector?

This research explores and answers the following questions through concepts such as Green Marketing and its roles towards the consumer such as green consumption and green consumer behaviour, perceived green image, perceived risk, purchase intention, the role of green claims in green marketing as well as trust and skepticism of consumers towards perceived greenwashing.

COMPREHENSIVE THEORETICAL BASIS

Green Marketing Definition

Green marketing is defined as the usual marketing activity consisting of the basic marketing mix elements (product, place, price,

promotion) particularly for the objective to minimize negative environmental impact (Oyewole,2001). Unlike marketing for regular products, green marketing targets consumers who practice green consumption (McDaniel & Rylander, 1993) and exists due to the increase of the concern towards the environment and living an environmentally-friendly lifestyle. (Nguyen et al., 2019) by communicates the environmental benefits of brands and their products in order to accommodate consumers' environmental expectations and needs (Szabo & Webster, 2020).Green Marketing communicates in various areas such as the production process of green products, the packaging and ingredients and impacts towards the environment (Frank Martin & Ken Peattie , 2012).

Green Consumption

Green consumption, according to Kazdin (2009), is the consumption behaviour in which it minimizes environmental impact. Some examples of such consumption activities include conserving water, consuming products with recyclable materials, and reducing gas emissions and carbon footprint through the use of public transportations. In relation to sustainable consumption and development, green consumption itself specifically focuses on the health and safety of consumers as well as the protection and preservation of the environment. (Li.M.L, 2020). Due to the increase in environmental issues, companies as well as consumers both have an increasing awareness of the environment and green consumption. Hence, consumers nowadays tend to purchase eco-friendly products taking consideration towards the environment (Chen et al., 2015). Market-wise, a survey conducted by WWF (World Wildlife Fund) Indonesia and Nielsen in 2017 reported that 63% of Indonesian consumers showed

willingness to consume high-priced, eco-friendly products. Green marketing provides environmental information and knowledge to the consumer, increases awareness towards the environment, leading them to adopt green consumption as a lifestyle and green consumer behaviour. (Cherian & Jacob, 2012 ; Öztürk, Resul, 2020)

Green Consumer Behaviour

Furthermore, as environmental issues have been gaining increasing prominence and become a critical concern for governments, the public, and marketers alike. The green market, a rapidly growing segment, has become an avenue for competitive advantage and added value.

The perception that the planet is facing significant levels of pollution and degradation has led to the rise of the environmental protection movement (Lee, 2009), and concurrently, the expansion of a new market segment known as green consumers, which is the type of consumers that green marketing targets and communicates to. These consumers are eco-conscious, the term for being environmentally conscious refers to an individual's ability to participate in eco-friendly behavior (Zelezny & Schultz, 2000) such as doing measures and actions to solve and contribute positively to environmental problems due to their concern for the environment. Eco-consciousness also includes awareness as well as interest towards environmental problems, and relate to the consumption of eco-friendly products as a part of protecting the environment. (Kim.N & Lee.K, 2023). As such this consumption behavior can be seen through concerns in the environmental or ecological aspect of the occurrences be it in the individual scope or even the world.

The adoption of green consumer behaviors are generally associated with green consumption, or the consumption of goods that don't cause pollution or damage to the natural environment in addition to having a moral compass towards social responsibility and awareness. As such, with individuals becoming conscious of the impact of their consumption on the environment, there is some indication that they make efforts to modify their attitudes and behaviors for the betterment of future generations (Urien and Kilbourne, 2011). While meeting personal needs continues to be important, there has been a shift in more recent times towards prioritizing environmental conservation and social awareness (Paul et al., 2016).

Perceived Green Image, Perceived Price and Green Trust

According to Chen and Chain (2010), a brand's green image is defined as the perception of a consumer towards a certain brand's concern and awareness towards the environment. This could be in the form of a brand's partnerships, activities, production process and contributions and attributes such as the packaging of the product related to the environment through green marketing. How a consumer perceives a brand's green image is essential as it can reinforce memories and associations of the brand (Errajaa et al., 2020) in relation to the environment. Moreover, a brand's green image has positive impacts towards the brand and the company itself such as creating environmental awareness and contributions as well as environmental regulations, resulting in positive impacts towards consumers such as their satisfaction towards the brand in terms of environmental demands and expectations, and fulfilling their green consumption needs (Hu and Wall, 2005). Moreover, a brand's green image such as its

environmental features and benefits could also lead to an increase the value and quality, and at the same time decreasing a consumer's price sensitivity, resulting in consumers willing to pay premium prices (Celia Stall-Meadows & Anne Davey , 2013) this is also stated by Singh and Pandey (2018) regarding value-based pricing theory. The reason why consumers are willing to pay reasonably higher prices towards these eco-friendly products is the notion that these products contain environmental and health benefits that fulfill their needs. (Dekhili & Achabou, 2012 ;Charter, M. 1992).

Aside from consumer satisfaction and fulfillment, there are other aspects that has an impact through a brand's green image such as consumer trust, how a consumer perceives risk towards the brand's products, ultimately leading to consumer's purchase intention (Chen, 2010). This is since a positive brand's green image has a significant impact towards establishing and gaining consumer trust (Sallam, 2016; Flavian et al.,2005; lin et al., 2017) by reducing a consumer's perceived risk. And hence, a positive brand image could also increase a customer's purchase intention (Chen, 2010). Additionally, the more credible and evident a brand's green image and the green claims perceived by consumers, the chances are that consumers are more likely to gain trust towards the brand, and purchase the brand's products since it fulfills their environmental expectations towards the brand, resulting in brand loyalty in the long term and word of mouth recommendations (Delgado Ballester et al, 2003; Salehzadeh et al., 2021)

Perceived Risk

When a consumer decides to purchase a new product, there are several perceived risks that a consumer perceives towards a product.

According to Frank-Martin Belz and Ken Peattie (2012), There are several perceived risks such as:

1. Financial risks: the risk that a product is not worth the financial costs post-adoption.
2. Performance risks: the risk that a product doesn't work as expected by the consumer
3. Physical risk: the risk perceived by consumers that the product would cause harmful or health consequences towards the consumer who adopts the product.
4. Time risk: refers to the risk perceived that the use of the product will not be worth the time, or that the product itself is too time-consuming to use.
5. Social risk: this perceived risk is related to the negative reactions that a consumer would receive from their surroundings or their social network when adopting that product.
6. Psychological risk: this risk refers to the risk perceived that the consumer would experience post-purchase regret, anxiety, worry, frustration and any other psychological pain points.

Due to consumers being more eco-conscious, and the increase in the concern towards the environment, this leads to green perceived risk which is defined by Chen and Chang (2012) as the environmental consequences that are expected or perceived by consumers associated with their purchasing behaviour. Additionally, according to Gillespie (2008), when consumers distrust a certain company or brand due to its deceptive green marketing strategies, this consequently leads to a higher green perceived risk towards the brand's environmental conduct, as well as their personal reputation or image environmental-

wise. (Chen et al., 2019). As mentioned earlier, green marketing plays a role in communicating a positive green brand image, in order to reduce perceived risk.

Purchase Intention

Green purchase intention is when green consumers make purchasing decisions, they express concerns about the environmental performance of products and how it fulfills their environmental needs (Zhang et al., 2018). Said willingness to conduct a particular action or behavior whilst driven through individual values and attitude is known as behavioural, and such willingness could influence an individual's action (Lai & Cheng, 2016). Consumers are concerned with the product quality and environmental consequences related to the product when they make their purchase decision. It is also when a consumer prefers to purchase eco-friendly products over non-eco-friendly products as a better alternative (Rahim et al., 2016; M.K. Ghassani, 2022). Furthermore, according to (Chen et al., 2014), green marketing creates a favourable green brand image in order to increase purchasing intention and willingness to purchase these brands' products. Green purchasing intentions thus is the byproduct of consumers willing to purchase a specific product because of their environmental attitudes and is represented through the extent of consumers willing to purchase a product or service from an environmentally friendly company or brand (Newton et al., 2015).

There are several other factors that lead to a consumer's green purchase intention towards the product, such as the brand's green image (Chen, 2010), consumers' environmental concern and their tendency to consume green products (Kim.N & Lee.K, 2023), trust towards the brand from credibility of its green brand

image, green claims or recommendations from their social networks (Chen et al., 2012), as well as the green perceived risk towards the brand's products as the higher the perceived risk, the unlikely it is for consumers to have purchase intention towards these products (Mitchell, 1999; Chen & Chang, 2012).

Implementation of Green Marketing: Green Marketing Strategies

Based on the Journal of Consumer Marketing by Stephen W. McDaniel and David H. Rylander (1993), there are two approaches when it comes to green marketing:

1. Defensive strategy: implemented by most brands, the defensive strategy minimizes negative consequences by doing the minimum such as complying on environmental regulations to minimize tax, boycotts and another which is to play along with the competitor's strategies environmental-wise in order to stay competitive, otherwise, brands who do not react or address environmental issues will face a decline in their market share (Miller, 1990).
2. Assertive strategy: this alternative strategy provides an ideal opportunity for brands to have sustainable competitive advantage in which brands take initiative to bring more than what is expected by consumers and the environment regulations. It is more on responding to the market demands and hence, it is a more profitable approach since it is consumer-oriented (Wells, 1990).

The assertive strategy is advantageous as it builds the brand image as a true activist that addresses environmental issues, hence, becoming an environmental leader as a brand.

Examples of personal care brands that implement this strategy is the Body Shop, one of the competitors of Love Beauty and Planet.

Role of Green Claims in Green Marketing

One way of brands implementing green marketing is by communicating the environmental aspect of brands through green claims. Green-claims are assertions made about the environmental benefits in a certain product as stated by Organization of Economic Collaboration and Development (OECD). These claims are reflected through the materials and/or the packaging of the product and communicates how environmentally responsible the brand or the product is through any of the stages of manufacturing and consumption stages or other environmental actions such as decreasing a percentage of water, plastic, waste, etc. Green claims in brands are communicated and provided directly on the product's packaging or through other advertising channels and media such as posters, websites, social media and TV, bulletin boards, product instruction and care manuals, etc. These claims typically come in the form of logos and eco-labels, words and symbols and even brand names or are provided as further information to the product (ISEAL Alliance, 2015), and make up a brand's green image.

Moving on to green claims, There are various of types of environmental labelling when it comes to implementing green claims in Indonesia which is standardized similarly to international standards by the Indonesian Ministry of Environment and Forestry:

1. Type 1 - voluntary, multi-criteria based with an evaluation process by an independent third party. Type 1 labels are environmental labels who are developed by a third party such as a governmental or private organization.

2. Type 2- self-declared "green" claims with independent third-party evaluation.
3. Type 3- Declarations of environmental labels based on a quantified product information.

Due to consumers being concerned towards the environment, consumers tend to value transparency when it comes to purchasing goods (Debevoise & Plimpton, 2021) since sustainability nowadays is essential for consumers (Martins. A, 2023). Hence, more and more brands nowadays are emphasizing on the environmental features and benefits of their products offered in advertisements and then selling the product at a higher price since the perception of green products as a differentiating value leads to a higher willingness to pay a premium price (Dekhili & Achabou, 2012). The emphasis on the environmental aspect of the product is not only found on food and beverage products but also personal care products, cosmetics and beauty products as well as household products. With that being said, green claims in a way are essential since this enables consumers to contribute a positive impact to society as well as the environment and according to Szabo and Webster (2020), Green claims are an important, helpful element for customers in making purchasing decisions as they depend on these green claims as a part of product information. Hence, environmental claims could be of aid to consumers in leading to purchase (White, et. al., 2019). This is proven since the growing awareness of Indonesian consumers towards consuming eco-friendly products and the increasing number of producers who are able to produce eco-labeled, certified products marks the progress and readiness of the Indonesian industry and market to implement production and consumption practices that pay attention

to environmental aspects according to the Office of Communication and Information of East Java Province Green claims are neutral by nature and are used to indicate environmental benefits that are contained in a certain product. United Kingdom's Government Campaign for green claims states that Green claims could be genuine should it be proven right in terms of environmental impact, and they could also be misleading when proven otherwise, in which the term for misleading green claims is called greenwashing.

Greenwashing as a Challenge of Green Marketing

Greenwashing is a term coined by environmentalist Jay Westerveld as a form of a green marketing communication strategy where consumers are deceived by a company or a brand's environmental aspects such as benefits, responsibilities, actions and policies. According to Terrachoice (2010), it is defined as "the act of misleading consumers regarding the environmental practices of a company or the environmental performance and positive communication about environmental performance". Greenwashing is a phenomenon companies are guilty of greenwashing as a method to cover up their corporate agendas that are not sustainable (Karliner, J. 2001) in order to create a better perception and green image to appeal consumers towards their company and their brands (Condon, 2020; Darke and Ritchie 2007), therefore increasing profit (Du, 2015).

While green marketing strategies aim to communicate the brand's environmental contributions and awareness as a unique differentiator, there are also some challenges that come with green marketing, such as consumers being skeptical of green claims due to greenwashing, this is because not all

green marketing strategies, specifically when it comes to communicating green claims are genuinely reflecting the brand or the company's actual actions and responsibility towards the environment. Moreover, some companies and brands exaggerate when communicating their environmental responsibility and conduct (Garfield, 1991), consequently leading to consequences towards the consumer, and further causing backlash to the company and the brand itself.

Types of Greenwashing

A study by marketing firm Terrachoice discusses the "sins of greenwashing" which comes in 7 forms (TerraChoice Environmental Marketing, 2009 ; Dahl, 2010)

1. Hidden trade-off: this is when a product is claimed as green despite the fact it may cause underlying environmental issues.
2. No proof: refers to green claims in which its supporting evidence and other information such as certifications or accreditations made by third-parties could not be accessed/ made easily accessible to the public.
3. Vagueness: refers to green claims that are communicated broadly, causing ambiguity towards the consumer such as "all-natural" or "all recyclable". This is caused by a green claim that is not specific and it's poorly defined in terms of accuracy.
4. Irrelevance: refers to green claims that though it communicates the truth, it is irrelevant since it does not help consumers when it comes to choosing the products.
5. Fibbing: refers to green claims that are outright false and proving to be not true, examples of green claims that fall into this category of sin would be claims

of certifications from a non-existent third party institution.

6. Lesser of two evils: refers to green claims that although are true, the claims are covering up or distracting consumers from the product's actual health and environmental risks.
7. Worshipping false labels: refers to companies or brands who "exploit consumers' demands for third-party approval" through giving false labels and claims of endorsements from third-parties. Examples would be the term "eco-preferred".

Perceived Greenwashing, Trust and Skepticism

How a consumer perceives a brand or a product's green image as well as their own personal environmental beliefs, values and responsibilities leads to how they perceive greenwashing (Szabo. S & Webster. J, 2020 ; Pierce et al, 1999) Eco-conscious consumers who have a high sense of environmental responsibility have willingness to prefer brands with environmental benefits and even adjusting their own behaviors for the sake of protecting the environment (Edelman, 2012 ; Szabo. S & Webster. J, 2020) however they are more cautious as they are skeptical towards these green claims stated by brands and companies due to perceived greenwashing.

Aside from green claims, consumers could also perceive greenwashing through stimuli such as elements contained in images or sounds in advertisements and in-store experiences as well as symbols that evoke nature or the environment. Despite these stimuli convincing consumers that a brand is indeed aware of the environment or that the nature of the brand or the products itself are eco-friendly, there's a chance it could mislead consumers for a

better green image and value of the brand. (Schmuck et al., 2018). According to Parguel et al. (2015), this type of greenwashing using stimulus refers to executional greenwashing, while written information in forms of false claims lacking transparency and wordings refers to claim greenwashing. Additionally, the more a brand communicates their green claims regularly as their marketing activity, skepticism would arise. Consumers would think that the brand's parent company is doing so for ulterior motives such as the sake of maintaining or promoting its CSR or Corporate Social Responsibility (Prasad and Holzinger, 2013) or that consumers might feel like that their environmental concern and interest is misused by companies to capitalize and gain profit as a marketing strategy, and that companies of brands are merely doing it for the trend as an opportunity (S. Johansson et al., 2020). This is a phenomenon in which, based on Nyilasy et al. (2014), is when consumers assign ulterior motives especially to these brands that contradict their actual environmental performance when communicating green claims.

Consequences could happen should consumers feel skepticism due to perceiving or be confronted by greenwashing in certain brands and their products. Based on a study conducted by Bulut et al. (2021), a consumer is unlikely to purchase that product given that the consumer perceives greenwashing despite the fact that the consumer is eco-conscious and shows high concern towards the environment due to skepticism leading to distrust therefore, resulting in decreased purchase intention (Chen, 2012 ; Albayrak et al., 2011 ; Szabo. S & Webster. J, 2020). In the long run, perceived greenwashing could also reduce green brand loyalty, or in other words the repurchasing of the same brand's products due to distrust (

Slaughter, 2008). However, on the other hand, Kraft and Saito (2014) states that if a consumer could not differentiate between genuine or misleading green claims communicated, their attitude and trust towards the brand or the company remains unaffected (Szabo .S & Webster. J, 2020). This, unfortunately, causes consumers to be unaware of the consequences of their purchase intentions. (Horiuchi & Schuchard,2019)

This is why it is recommended that when it comes to external market communication, it is essential to maintain the credibility of green claims and communicate “as it is” true to the company or the brand’s environmental responsibilities and actions instead of exaggerating these claims. It is important that claims should be proved to be true and meaningful since eco-conscious consumers have high expectations when it comes to these green claims. (Wells, 1990).

METHODS

This research is done qualitatively through phenomenology study as qualitative research aids in clarifying and the reasoning behind behaviours and different perspectives of individuals (Lauri,2019) as well as However as the study revolves around a phenomenological study in regards to the global phenomenon of greenwashing, therefore the qualitative research revolves around the “when” and “how” (Neubauer et. al., 2019). Moreover, qualitative study according to Tong et. al (2012) is to elaborate “human attitudes, feelings, and perceptions” which is relevant to this research topic focusing on the perceptions, behaviours and purchasing intentions of consumers towards the green marketing and greenwashing of personal care products, with Love Beauty and Planet as one of the personal care products as a case study subject.

This research is done by collecting both primary and secondary data, in which the secondary data refers to a derived model from existing literature Kahraman & Kazançoğlu (2019) with the questions adapted from the emerging themes as per findings of the referred existing literature, and the primary data being collected through consumers who are users of Love Beauty and Planet as one of their personal care products through Focus Group Discussions. Furthermore, content analysis, specifically thematic analysis is used to analyze insights obtained from primary data.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Eco-Consciousness

The theme, eco-consciousness itself revolves on the consumer’s eco-friendly behaviour, findings include consumers doing actions to contribute to environmental problems, such as searching for local and natural made products as alternatives as well as bringing own cutleries and lunch box to reduce waste, using reusable bags for shopping to reduce plastic consumption and practicing proper disposal and recycling of waste.

The second finding related to eco-friendly behaviour is the concern and awareness as well as interest to environmental problems as eco-conscious consumers. The environmental issues concerned vary from food waste, the decrease in the wellbeing of marine-life, and poor waste management. A unique insight of eco-consciousness would be among the six informants from the Gen-Z demographic group, one informant brought up guilt in causing environmental consequences as a result of inevitable purchasing of non eco-friendly products;

Informant P1: “ kalo misalnya among all the eco-friendly productsnya gak cocok

sama aku ya terpaksa dong belinya yang gak eco-friendly, cuman me personally kalo emang gak ada yang cocok, aku gak beli. Aku nahan kebutuhan aku. I'm the person yang kalo emang gak ada, ya udah. Gak maksain gitu loh, daripada guilty (of buying non eco-friendly products). “

Efforts to modify attitudes and behaviours for environmental cause is also found in the informants answers, this includes informant's realization to change and make efforts such as reducing plastic consumption by bringing cutleries, using stainless straws as alternatives to disposable single-use straws. This shows that the insights support Urien and Kilbourne's statement. Moreover, Some informants showed realizations to change their attitudes and behaviours for a positive environmental cause due to external situations they encountered and are made aware of.

To summarize, consumers who are eco-conscious engage in eco-friendly behaviour and show environmental concern and awareness. From the concern towards the environment, consumers develop a realization to change and make efforts and initiatives to contribute to a better environmental cause, this includes consumption of eco-friendly products as alternatives to reduce plastic consumption and waste. There could be an instance of guilt for indirectly causing environmental consequences through the purchase and consumption of non eco-friendly products. These insights from informants were also supported by the theories of green consumption and green consumer behaviour, which supports the statement from Chen et al. (2015), Zeleny & Schultz (2000) and the study by Kim & Lee (2023).

Perceived Green Image

Perceived Green Image is the second theme in which consumers perceive a brand 's green image through different aspects. In this case, findings revealed that consumers perceive Love Beauty and Planet's green image through partnerships and collaborations with other green organizations such as Sejauh Mata Memandang. Informants also revealed that they purchased the product due to the campaign resulted from the collaboration between Love Beauty and Planet X Sejauh Mata Memandang.

Love Beauty and Planet is also known for its campaign, love box where consumers drop empty product packages to a designated box where these empty product packages are to be recycled for future usage. This Love Box campaign induces awareness of consumers towards their brand's green image. Another campaign regarding animal cruelty is also brought up aside from the Love Box. The campaign focusing on animal cruelty is elaborated on Love Beauty and Planet's website which shows the brand's stance against animal cruelty.

Aside from the brand's activities and initiatives, another way informants perceive Love Beauty and Planet's green image is through their products, in which they are made with minimal ingredients and environmentally-friendly product content and packaging. An informant revealed that Love Beauty and Planet's products claim to contain no paraben and that paraben is a dangerous chemical that causes cancer and environmental consequences. This indicates that Love Beauty and Planet's products is safe in terms of the environment, which makes it credible, and reducing the perceived risk that arises from the brand's green image,

which also supports the study conducted by Salehzadeh et al. (2021) involving green brand image.

P2: “dia ngeclaim kalo dia no paraben, no silicon sama sylicic acid apa gitu aku lupa deh. Kalau paraben emang jujur aku sangat menghindari produk kecantikan apapun yang ada parabennya. Karena aku sempat baca study, kalo misalkan paraben itu bisa satu, bisa menyebabkan cancer. Aku takut banget. Dan yang kedua, dia juga contohnya kayak aku lupa, sejenis paraben, keluarga paraben pokoknya ,dia bisa menyebabkan kerusakan coral, limbahnya. Jadi aku bener” aku gamau pake produk yang ada paraben dan dia (Love Beauty Planet) menjawab permasalahan aku”

Price Perception

Price Perception is how consumers perceive the price for eco-friendly products. In this research, findings revealed that majority of informants from both Gen-Z and Millenial demographic groups stated that eco-friendly personal care products are priced higher, or expensive.

Informant P5: “ kalo yang ecofriendly tend to be pricey, aku merasa gitu sih, salah satu produk yang aku pake itu feminine product, itu apa sih, itu kayak tend to be more pricey dari yang gak eco-friendly, yang biasa gitu”

Answers revealed that the reason behind the higher prices is either due to the use of natural ingredients, the quality, production costs and process, and the health benefits that these eco-friendly product offer. However, they see Love Beauty and Planet as personal care product that is affordable compared to other eco-friendly personal care products that are typically priced higher.

P5: “Harganya bisa dibilang cukup affordable sih, karena pas ngelihat oh ini eco-friendly terus pas ngeliat harganya “ hah? “ Ecofriendly segini harganya dibanding sama produk yang lain untuk ecofriendly menurut aku lumayan terjangkau.”

In terms of willingness to pay, the majority of informants from both demographic groups stated that they are willing to pay extra. The reasons vary, from willingness to pay due to the ability to contribute to the environment and the business, the physical benefits offered from the product, and the quality of the product. A unique insight regarding this theme would be coming from one informant from the millenials age group stated that her willingness to pay would be as a long-term investment.

P9: willingness ya gimana? ya tentu pasti mau ya, karena memang istilahnya investasi jangka panjang sebenarnya, ya you get what you pay lah.

Perceived Risk

The perceived risk towards eco-friendly personal care products, including Love Beauty and Planet was found to be physical risk, performance risk, green risk and psychological risk. Most answers were found to be towards perceived physical risk concerning health and compatibility towards one’s body. Additionally, an informant’s perceived physical risk was also found to be coming from perceived greenwashing where its misleading claims could indirectly affect a consumer’s health. Green risk is also present as one of the answers within the perceived risk theme. Some informants perceive that the product may cause negative environmental causes. Perceived green risk could also lead to skepticism towards the product and the brand.

As eco-conscious consumers of eco-friendly personal care products, these informants mostly perceive physical risk towards these products which also affects their purchase intention. Other than that are performance risks and green risk.

Perceived Greenwashing

There are two aspects in which informants perceive greenwashing ; through stimuli from advertisements, and in-store experiences as well as written information. Stimuli includes elements associated with nature such as natural colours, sounds, scent and ambience in the offline stores of these brands. Informants from both Gen-Z and Millennial demographic groups perceived greenwashing through visual stimuli mainly from elements associated with colours in advertisement and store ambience. On the other hand, perceived greenwashing from written content in their advertising touchpoints due to exaggerated communication and with Love Beauty and Planet showing an “obvious” brand name.

In summary, informants perceive greenwashing through the stimuli received from advertising touchpoints, store ambience with the heavy use of elements associated with nature. Aside from stimuli, informants perceive greenwashing in Love Beauty and Planet through its loud and obvious communication through their brand name itself and copywriting in their advertising touchpoints such as their official website. This means that Love Beauty and Planet in a way is guilty of executional and claim greenwashing through communicating their brand’s green image, validating Szabo & Webster’s statement regarding the perception of a brand’s green image leading to perceived greenwashing.

Trust

Trust theme revolves how informants trust the brand as consumers. Findings include trust towards the brand, which comes in forms of trust towards their environmental conduct from activities, campaigns, and their products, the credibility of the brand as well as their reputation through recommendations from the informant’s social networks and personal experiences using the brand.

Some informants from the millennial demographic group trust the brand due to their environmental aspects through the brand’s green image, such as the packaging, and how the brand’s products are recyclable. Implying that it fulfills their environmental expectations. Moreover, informants also trust the Love Beauty and Planet due to its credibility from campaigns, as well as its reputation being one of the well-known brands through recommendations from family members and social networks via social media and advertisements. Informants also trust the Love Beauty and Planet from their personal experiences using Unilever’s products, which is Love Beauty and Planet’s parent company.

Additionally when it comes to trust, some informants perceive green claims as a measure of trust as they stated that green claims could assist them as consumers to compare and be critical on the credibility of these claims communicated and whether or not they are true and trustworthy, and that Green claims are also stated to help increase awareness in eco-friendly brands.

Some informants from the Gen- group trust these green claims as they are confident that the brand itself is trustworthy to be able to disclose their claims and certifications.

The trust in green claims is stated to affect purchase intention.

P1: “kalo brandnya ini proudly close their certificates or other stuff publicly, kan artinya mereka percaya diri kayak yakin bahwa mereka ini bener gitu. They're certificate their claims are ada buktinya gitu bahwa ini gak bohongan, gak cuman beli doang. Itu affect my purchase intention sih.”

Furthermore, both Gen-Z and Millennial informants shared on how to increase their trust towards brands implementing green marketing. They value transparency when communicating green claims through proofs of evidence. These evidence could be numerical which they refer to as accessibility to data and reports containing data results, physical proof referring to the transparency of how disposed products are being processed or recycled, and social proofs referring to involvement of consumers in their campaigns.

P6: they can bikin campaign yang bener” involve the customer more gitu jadi kayak the customer tuh bisa langsung lihat dan kayak mungkin kontribusi to be like more eco-friendly for example, kayak yang misalkan yang kayak pungutin sampah walaupun itu bukan sampah dari brand mereka, but they show that they care about the environment regardless itu sampah brand mereka atau bukan.

P1: mereka ada data detailnya on sampah” sticker berapa, sampah plastic keras berapa, terus kayak ditunjukin video how to recycle this part gitu loh. Terus ditunjukin ke kita particles” plastiknya diolah jadi gimana gitu.

Skepticism

The opposite of the trust theme would be skepticism, which is another theme emerged.

Findings revealed from both Gen-Z and Millennial informants that as consumers of Love Beauty and Planet, their skepticism arises from vague claims and perceived greenwashing. These claims are vague due to either lacking transparency, consistency and proof of evidence in terms of data accessibility when it comes to communicating these claims, and that these claims are merely advertisement copywriting or persuasive wording.

Informant P1: cuman they don't inform us siapa yang ngolah, tipe sampahnya apa gitu loh, terus kayak menurut aku kurang transparan aja gitu compared to kayak Waste for Change, atau Sungai Watch they are 100% sustainable.

Findings also reveal that informants also associate their skepticism towards Love Beauty and Planet's greenwashing to ulterior motives such as communicating green claims as a marketing or PR tool to maintain Love Beauty and Planet and its parent company, Unilever's green image, or to keep up with market trends. In addition, a few findings reveal that suspicion arises due to greenwashing, precisely suspicion to the brand's pricing. A unique insight would be coming from a Gen-Z informant in which her skepticism about Love Beauty and Planet is due to her suspicion at Love Beauty and Planet's lower pricing.

P5: “ aku ya suspicious juga dari balik lagi ke price. Dia jatohnya kok harganya cukup rendah, sebuah produk yang eco-friendly gitu, rada sus disitu cuman kayak karena aku belum research jadi aku kayak ok ini eco-friendly gitu. Jadi sebenarnya ada suspicion gitu sih.”

Purchase Intention

There are various insights from Gen-Z and millennial informants when it comes to

purchase intention, that's because there are numerous factors that lead to purchase intention towards eco-friendly personal care products, including Love Beauty and Planet.

The first factor leading to purchase intention from these informants is the brand image such as their activities and partnerships with other organizations, campaigns and the product's attributes such as the packaging. A Gen-Z informant mentioned that the reason behind the purchase intention towards Love Beauty and Planet's competitor, Body shop, is due to their brand's activities and how their product packaging is made as eco-friendly as possible. This aligns with the literature review as well (Chen, 2010) stating that a positive brand image could lead to purchase intention. Secondly, some informants from Gen-Z and millennial demographic groups also revealed that their purchase intention is driven by the brand's credibility and reputation from their social networks and reviews that they trust. This aligns with the word of mouth statement based on Delgado Ballester et al. (2003)

The third driver to purchase intention of eco-friendly personal care products stated by informants is that eco-friendly products make better alternatives and are favored compared to non eco-friendly products. Said better alternatives refer to minimal ingredient content, and personal experiences using eco-friendly products.

Informant P6: "I don't know why tapi selama ini product eco-friendly yang I use tend to be better daripada yang gak eco-friendly."

Another reason that drives the purchase intention would be the informants' attitudes towards the environment, referring to how they feel about the product contributing to

a positive environmental cause. Again, this stems from the consumer's eco-consciousness and green consumption.

Informant P6: "it feels better, kayak oh I'm doing something good for the environment"

Uniquely, a millennial informant purchased the product for the sake of contributing towards positive environmental cause despite the fact that the product isn't compatible for the informant.

Informant P10: "Dan tadi Apa yang membuat aku beli product eco friendly? My effort to be more eco friendly aja, walau aku tahu kalau di badan aku terkadang nggak cocok."

Moreover, fulfillment of health and environmental expectations and needs is also a driving factor towards the purchase intention of these consumers. Health needs such as compatibility with the product plays a crucial role when purchasing the product, especially those with health conditions such as sensitive skin. As an eco-conscious consumer, some informants are also aware that certain ingredients are harmful towards health, such as paraben being one of the ingredients mentioned. Hence, the absence of harmful ingredients also fulfills the health needs of consumers, leading to purchase. On the other hand, informants state that their purchase intention is also driven by how well eco-friendly personal care products like Love Beauty and Planet are able to fulfill environmental expectations such as being able to reduce negative impact to the environment such as waste and water contamination, as well as being water-efficient. This aligns with the statement based on Zhang (2018) about how green purchase intention is when green consumers make purchasing decisions

based on the environmental performance of the products and how well it fulfills environmental needs, and supports this research's second proposition: Indonesian consumers purchase Love Beauty and Planet as an eco-friendly personal care brand to help protect the environment through its environmental benefits.

Lastly, some informants from both Gen-Z and millennial demographic groups also mention price to be a driver leading to purchase intention, it is revealed that the reason behind the purchase intention of Love Beauty and Planet is due to the affordability of the product and that it is an affordable alternative compared to other eco-friendly personal care products, and that it fits into the informant's budget. This is in a way contradictory to the findings of Kahraman and Kazançoğlu regarding skepticism towards lower prices since the results in this research indicates that some informants have their purchase intentions driven by lower prices despite the informants' willingness to pay for premium priced eco-friendly products.

P5: ketemu dengan istilahnya alternatif yang rada lebih murah dan lokal, jadi nyoba produk itu (Love Beauty and Planet) juga.

In addition, a millennial informant also implied that price, along with availability and compatibility also drives to loyalty and purchase intention.

P12 :kalo aku selama cocok di aku, gak masalah tetap pake, dan gampang dicari, harganya juga gak naik banyak” ya masih masuk budget, lanjut pake product itu

To summarize, as eco-conscious consumers, there are various factors that drives to

purchase intention aside from their eco-consciousness reflected on their attitude towards the environment and their tendency to favor eco-friendly products as better alternatives to non eco-friendly products ; such as the brand's green image, the level of their trust towards the brand, the awareness of ingredients and and how it fulfills their health and environmental expectations, and the affordability of the product itself.

Green Product Awareness

Green product awareness is the first novelty theme that has emerged from the findings. Green product awareness refers to how consumers were able to require information in regards to green products. Firstly consumers came aware through identifying certain ingredients that are used in the product. Chemical ingredients such as sulphates and parabens that are harmful not only to some users and their personal health but also towards the environment. In addition to the ingredient identification, knowledge of the product's existence also comes from the certifications that are presented with the product.

Furthermore, consumers are also aware and search for the credibility of the green claims, such as from personal lifestyles from participant P7 being vegan and in search vegan and cruelty free products. And so there is a certain level of research or at the very least intrigue in where does the certification come from or how the product presented by the company is able to gain certification. Participants also mention their methods in searching and verifying these claims as most mention that can be viewed through product packaging to compare ingredients to certification as well as through the brand's website. With that an additional insight of credibility being seen through transparency of

data and ingredients. The following statement expresses the previously aforementioned points.

Informant P10: “bener” research ya data, sertifikat, mungkin kayak tadi kayak transparansi misalnya carbon footprintnya berapa, air yang dipake seberapa banyak, terus cara mereka bahkan, tapi kayak gak ampe detail” banget tapi at least ada data” yang bisa aku baca lah. Terus misalnya kalau aku untuk sehari” kayak beli di supermarket, biasa sih aku lihat” dari ini vegan apa enggak, gitu” animal cruelty free apa enggak, sama tetep aware aja sih mereka, parent companynya apa, gitu”.”

Informant P11:” kalau misalkan kayak aku denger satu product yang claim kayak oh ini eco-friendly gitu dan mungkin aku ngelihat di claimnya dia apakah udah bersertifikasi atau belum.”

Green product awareness, according to Ritter et al. (2015) is created through the product’s attributes that make up a part of the brand’s green image such as the packaging, advertisements as well as the green claim itself. It is essential that a consumer should have green product awareness and be critical of it before purchase since it impacts on the decision making pre-purchase process and hence, assist in the increase of positive environmental objectives when purchased by the consumer. Being eco-conscious consumers, these insights reveal that the concern towards the environment leads these informants to be critical of evaluating information through green product awareness. Hence, the insight shows that green product awareness hence stems from environmental concern and brand image, and could lead to perceived greenwashing and trust towards the product.

Perceived Quality

Perceived quality is the second emerging novelty theme in which consumers perceive the quality of a green product through different aspects. Findings revealed that consumers perceive green product quality through different aspects. Firstly being ingredient quality. With how ingredients are used , having better impacts on the environment. Furthermore, how the perceived quality of a green product has a good quality is the minimum ingredients as well as the compatibility and longevity of the product.

Informant P2: “Aku sebenarnya juga lebih ngarah ke eco-friendly product, soalnya mereka juga pun, mereka punya apa ya, conscious ke lingkungan of course mereka juga tahanin dari segi quality productnya sendiri, bahan”nya apa aja yang dipake, “

In addition to ingredient quality there are two additional aspects in which a green product is assessed as usage quality and how the packaging provides an impression of quality as mentioned.

Informant P1:” my first impression is that, ini a high quality product.”

As such the impression or perception of the quality of a green product is seen through the quality as to how the product achieves the perceived benefits of ingredients, usage and last but not least the packaging. In the case of Love Beauty and Planet as a personal care product. A brand’s image is also formed by perceived quality, and that from there, consumers perceive the price based on the quality of the brand’s product perceived, hence aligning with the statement based on Celia Stall-Meadows & Anne Davey (2013) where a brand’s green image such as its

environmental features and benefits could also lead to an increase the value and quality and supports value-based pricing theory (Singh and Pandey,2018).

Green Product Availability

The third novelty comes from the emerging theme of green product availability. This refers to the consumers ability to access the green product. The findings indicate that there needs to be accessibility to the product to fulfill personal needs. Participants expressed that they have returned to buying off the shelf regular non green personal care products due to the lack of accessibility. The way participants mention said issue is that due to the lack of accessibility and availability of these products, although fulfilling their personal needs and fitting to their personal beliefs and morals are still hard to acquire. This can be attributed to pricing distribution, compatibility and time spent to find compatible green personal care products. With that it is hard to sustain a personal care product rotation when accessibility issues force them to have to resort to buying products that are available be it from supermarkets or readily available products in the drugstore. To the participants, achieving said criterias proves to still be a difficulty and hinders the sustained usage of green personal care products.

Informant P10: “aku masih belum maintain untuk kayak berusaha cari sabun ,cari sabun atau shampo atau beauty product yang bener eco-friendly banget. Karena jujur kayak yang tadi kita rasain susah untuk maintain hidup untuk pake se-green mungkin, se-vegan friendly mungkin, se animal-cruelty free mungkin. Apalagi yang dijual di sini juga kan, kalau yang, kita mau dapetin kriteria itu semua pasti mahal banget atau susah didapat.”

According to ElHaffar et al. (2020), A product's availability is essential should eco-conscious consumer would want to purchase an eco-friendly product and increase green consumption. If an eco-friendly product were to be hard to access, and that if a brand limits their number of sales touchpoints, this could lead to reduced green consumption and decreased purchase intention, (Vermeir & Verbeke, 2006).The findings proved these statements to be true. And hence, Love Beauty and Planet is doing the correct thing by increasing and continuously expanding its products to ease accessibility for eco-conscious consumers.

Brand Loyalty

The fourth last emerging theme is brand loyalty. This refers to the consumers attitude and loyalty towards the brand and product despite the knowledge of greenwashing. Participants indicated several factors that may contribute to loyalty towards the brand despite the apparent greenwashing. Firstly being the product compatibility. Participant mention that especially for personal care products, compatibility is one if not the major factor to why they would be loyal towards a brand. If a brand has a product that is highly compatible with their individual needs, loyalty can be ensured.

P9: “ok kalo loyal, balik lagi ke itu ya, cocok atau enggak ya. kalau udah cocok, biasanya aku gak ganti” product sih, yaudah selama barangnya masih diproduksi, selama barangnya bisa dibeli apalagi dijual dimanapun, gampang dicari, pasti pake itu terus. Gak mikirin 100% percaya gitu sih, karena semua bagian manapun maksudnya itu eco-friendly 100% pasti terlepas dari itu, dibalik itu pasti dia sudah teruji aman “

Secondly, price as pricing also determines the amount of expenditure consumers would have to spend to consume the product, as such the price of a green personal care product needs to be within their expected cost in the eyes of the consumer to become a factor in determining their loyalty. Lastly is the accessibility, many participants expressed that if the green product is easily accessed and acquired they would be more willing to repurchase and have loyalty towards the brand. With that, based on the findings and accounts given by the participants, the three factors that would determine why a consumer would still be loyal after being greenwashed would be the compatibility with the product, price and the accessibility of the product.

Some participants also express doubt and vague loyalties towards the brand due to the existence of substitutes in the market. The following reasons as to why there is still a lack of loyalty is due to being on the lookout for other brands, other products that have better credibility, certification and the ongoing personal need and motivation to purchase a product that performs better or perhaps is more compatible with them.

P5: “Cuman masalah loyal? hmmtttt..... I’m always on the lookout for new brands aja sih sebenarnya.”

Lastly is disloyalty towards the brand due to incompatibility. Participant P10 expresses that due to incompatibility towards a Love, Beauty, Planet product there is no need to maintain loyalty, also expressing that if it was compatible there would be a repurchase and brand loyalty. This may indicate the nature of personal care products as compatibility is a major aspect in brand loyalty in the industry.

Informant P10: “ kebetulan karena di aku kurang cocok, jadi obviously gak loyal. Udah say bye, udah lama, tapi kalo misalnya cocok, mungkin aku akan tetap pake.”

While Slaughter (2008) states that greenwashing reduced brand loyalty In the long run, findings from this research stated otherwise. Meaning that the findings do not support Slaughter’s statement regarding greenwashing and brand loyalty. This could be due to the presence of the attitude-behaviour gap which refers to the inconsistent actions and attitudes. Despite them being environmentally concerned and eco-conscious, their behavior doesn’t always match or express their level of eco-consciousness. (White et al., 2019).

Therefore, based on the findings from the FGD and existing literature as well as the correlations of each theme. The findings consists of all emerging themes from the FGD, with the themes derived from the existing study and model from Kahraman and Kazanconglu (2019), and novelty themes being brand loyalty, green perceived availability, green product awareness and perceived quality.

MANAGERIAL IMPLICATION

This research suggests that companies should allocate budgets to host environmentally-contributing events which involve consumers in order not only to increase engagement with the brand, but also as proof of social evidence and responsibility. And improve transparent marketing communication since transparency is greatly valued by eco-conscious consumers, research and development should be involved to communicate data transparently as a part of building the brand’s green image.

CONCLUSION

Based on the findings, Gen-Z and Millennial

consumers perceive Love Beauty and Planet's products as one of the eco-friendly personal care products to be premium-priced yet affordable, and of high quality with safe ingredients for use. Most participants also perceive Love Beauty and Planet to be fulfilling their environmental and health expectations. Factors such as the brand's green image including the packaging, advertisements and their collaboration with other NGOs like Sejahtera Mata Memandang are what drives them to their purchase intention towards Love Beauty and Planet. Aside from that are quality, affordability, the availability of the brand itself.

Love Beauty and Planet is also perceived to be really loud at their green marketing communication. Findings from their insights show that their brand name is really obvious at indicating that they are eco-friendly. However, some of them raised doubts on whether or not these green marketing communication strategies are genuine, especially when communicating their claims. Based on the findings, Love Beauty and Planet, is found to be guilty in executional greenwashing and claim greenwashing, and for committing the sin of vagueness and no proof based on Terrachoice's 7 sins of greenwashing due to the lack of transparency in those green claims communicated by Love Beauty and Planet, and is met with skepticism from consumers such as associating Love Beauty and Planet as a brand under Unilever, which is one of the contributors to waste in Indonesia as well as associating their skepticism from these perceived greenwashing to Unilever's motives such as staying relevant, or keeping up with market trends.

This also concludes that Love Beauty and Planet is still leaning to the defensive

approach, since there are still some aspects such as transparency of the claims and more environmental contributions expected by consumers.

Even so, some consumers also stated that they are confident with the green claims from Love Beauty and Planet, and helps to make purchase decisions as a measure of trust. But is greenwashing a crucial factor towards the purchase intentions and loyalty towards Love Beauty and Planet? The answer would be no, since findings also conclude that the consumer's loyalty is dependent on how compatible the product is with the consumer even though there is skepticism and perceived greenwashing. It's true that consumers would want to expect more from large companies like Unilever, but it doesn't make a huge impact on purchase and loyalty which is the consumer's inconsistency.

This research shows some other inconsistencies with the consumer's attitudes towards their environment and their purchasing behaviors as it does not reflect one another. Regardless, findings reveal that there are some similarities and novelties from the existing research and model. One interesting finding is that the loyalty theme isn't supported, nor it aligns with the existing literature and that the pricing aspect is partially supported due to the purchase intention driven by lower prices despite skepticism even though consumers are willing to pay more for eco-friendly products. This might be due to the presence of the attitude-behavior gap due to certain situations such as the quality, the attributes such as the ingredients and how it is compatible to the consumer, the availability of the product as well as price (Gleim et al., 2013; J. Norstedt, 2021).

Despite those inconsistencies and attitude-behaviour gaps, there are some consumers whose behaviours reflect their ecoconsciousness such as informant P10, who states that the reason behind purchase would be “my effort to be eco-friendly” despite incompatibility towards skin, and informant P1 who states that the consumer would hold needs and purchase until an eco-friendly product that is compatible is found, rather than be guilty of causing negative environmental impact due to the purchase and consumption of non eco-friendly products. Some consumers also do purchase Love Beauty and Planet because of the positive environmental benefits it offers and their attitudes towards the environment which is a driver of their purchase.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to express our utmost gratitude to God, for giving us the opportunity and the privilege to be able to conduct this thesis research for our final project. We would also

like to thank both our thesis advisors, Dr. Rudy Handoko and Mr. Alavi Ali for giving their never-ending support, prayers and for their valuable time and energy in committing to guide us with valuable, constructive feedback as well as their assistance throughout every step of this research, and for pushing us to continuously improve our research day by day.

We would also like to thank each and every one of our informants who are willing to spare their time to share their valuable insights as an essential element to our thesis, and special mentions to Green Welfare Indonesia for kindly providing us with one of their cherished members to become one of our informants who contributed in sharing these insights as well. This research could not have been completed without them.

Moreover, we would also like to acknowledge the journal of Kahraman and Kazanconglu (2019) as this research is derived from their findings.

REFERENCES

- (2021). Retrieved from <https://www.debevoise.com/insights/publications/2021/07/the-nature-of-natural-advertising-claims>
- (N.d.-a). Retrieved from <https://kominfo.jatimprov.go.id/read/umum/kesadaran-konsumen-konsumsi-produk-ramah-lingkungan-meningkat>
- (N.d.-c). Retrieved from <https://www.unilever.co.id/files/09197eb4-22dd-413a-b410-16b0d9d10171/corporate-presentation-2022-klekz8.pdf>
- (N.d.-d). Retrieved from <https://greenclaims.campaign.gov.uk/#:~:text=Green%20claims%20are%20genuine%20when,commonly%20known%20as%20%27greenwashing%27>
- (N.d.-e). Retrieved from <https://www.oecd.org/sti/consumer/48127506.pdf>
- (N.d.-f). Retrieved from <http://perpustakaan.menlhk.go.id/pustaka/images/docs/Ekolabel.pdf>
- (N.d). Retrieved from <https://www.statista.com/outlook/cmo/beauty-personalcare/indonesia#analyst-opinion>
In-text reference: (Statista,2020)
- (N.d.-g). Retrieved from https://www.wwf.id/upload/2021/09/Panduan_Pengadaan_Berkelanjutan-ID.pdf
- Aggarwal, P., & Kadyan, A. (2011). Greenwashing: The darker side of CSR. *Indian Journal of Applied Research*, 4(3), 61–66. doi:10.15373/2249555x/mar2014/20 In-text reference: Aggarwal and Kadyan (2014)
- Aji, H., & Sutikno, B. (2015). The extended consequence of green- washing: Perceived consumer skepticism. *International Journal of Business and Information*, 10(4). In-text reference: (Aji & Sutikno, 2015)
- Albayrak, T., Aksoy, Ş., & Caber, M. (2013). The influence of skepticism on green purchase behavior. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*. doi:10.1037/t42780-000 In-text reference: Albayrak et al., 2011
- Atkinson, L., & Kim, Y. (2014). “I drink it anyway and I know I shouldn’t”: Understanding green consumers’ positive evaluations of norm-violating non-green products and misleading green advertising. *Environmental Communication*, 9(1), 37–57. doi:10.1080/17524032.2014.932817 (Atkinson & Kim, 2014)
- Bangsa, A. B., & Schlegelmilch, B. B. (2020). Linking sustainable product attributes and consumer decision-making: Insights from a systematic review. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 245, 118902. doi:10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.118902
- Belz, F.-M., Peattie, K., Belz, F.-M., & Belz, F.-M. (2012). *Sustainability Marketing: A global perspective* (2nd ed.). Chichester: Wiley.
- Berg, B. L., & Lune, H. (2017). *Qualitative research methods for the Social Sciences*. Pearson Education (US).
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3(2), 77–101. Brooks, A., Fletcher, K., Francis, R. A., Rigby, E. D., & Roberts, T. (2017). Fashion, sustainability, and the anthropocene. *Utopian Studies*, 28(3), 482–504. doi:10.5325/utopianstudies.28.3.0482
- Bulut, C., Nazli, M., Aydin, E., & Haque, A. U. (2021). Retrieved from <https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/YC-10-2020-1241/full/html> In-text reference: (Bulut et al.,2021)
- Chen, T. B., & Chain, L. T. (2010). Attitude towards the environment and green products: Consumer’ perspective management science and engineering. *Journal of Marketing*, 4(2), 27-39. In-text reference: (Chen and Chain, 2010)
- Chen, Y., & Chang, C. (2012). Enhance green purchase intentions. *Management Decision*, 50(3), 502–520. doi:10.1108/00251741211216250 In-text reference: (Chen et al., 2012)
- Chen, Y.-S. (2010). The drivers of Green Brand Equity: Green Brand Image, Green Satisfaction, and Green Trust. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 93(2), 271–286. doi:10.1007/s10551-009-0223-9 In-text reference: (Chen, 2010)
- Chen, Y. S., Lin, C. Y., & Weng, C. S. (2015). The Influence of Environmental Friendliness on Green Trust: The Mediation Effects of Green Satisfaction and Green Perceived Quality. *Sustainability*, 7, 10135-10152, doi:10.3390/su70810135. In-text reference: (Chen et al., 2015)
- Chen, Y.-S., & Chang, C.-H. (2012). Greenwash and Green Trust: The mediation effects of green consumer confusion

- and Green Perceived Risk. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 114(3), 489–500. doi:10.1007/s10551-012-1360-0 In-text reference: (Chen & Chang, 2012)
- Chen, Y. S., Lin, C. L., & Chang, C. H. (2014). The influence of greenwash on green word-of-mouth (green WOM): the mediation effects of green perceived quality and green satisfaction. *Quality & Quantity*, 48(5), 2411-2425. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-013-9898-1> In-text reference: (Chen et al., 2014)
- Cherian, J., & Jacob, J. (2012). Green Marketing: A study of consumers' attitude towards environment friendly products. *Asian Social Science*, 8(12). doi:10.5539/ass.v8n12p117 In-text reference: (Cherian & Jacob, 2012)
- Dahl, R. (2010). Greenwashing. *Environmental Health Perspectives*, 118, A246–A252. In-text reference: (Dahl,2010)
- Darke, P. R., & Ritchie, R. J. B. (2007). The defensive consumer: Advertising deception, defensive processing, and Distrust. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 44(1), 114–127. doi:10.1509/jmkr.44.1.11
- Dekhili, S., & Achabou, M. A. (2012). Price fairness in the case of green products: Enterprises' policies and consumers' perceptions. *Business Strategy and the Environment*, 22(8), 547–560. doi:10.1002/bse.1763 In text reference: (Dekhili & Achabou, 2012)
- Du, X. (2014). How the market values greenwashing? evidence from China. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 128(3), 547–574. doi:10.1007/s10551-014-2122-y
- ElHaffar, G., Durif, F., & Dubé, L. (2020). Towards closing the attitude-intention-behavior gap in Green Consumption: A narrative review of the literature and an overview of future research directions. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 275, 122556. doi:10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.122556 In-text reference: ElHaffar et al., 2020)
- Edelman. (2012). Good Purpose 2012. Retrieved from <https://bschool.nus.edu.sg/pdf/acsep/2012-Edelman-goodpurpose%20AE-Study.pdf>. In-text reference: (Edelman,2012)
- Errajaa, K., Daucé, B., & Legohérel, P. (2020). Consumer reactions to olfactory congruence with brand image. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 52, 101898. doi:10.1016/j.jretconser.2019.101898 In-text reference: (Errajaa et al., 2020)
- Flavián, C., Guinalú, M., & Torres, E. (2005). Retrieved from <https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/10662240510615191/full/html> In-text reference: (Flavian et al.,2005)
- Gillespie, E. (2008). Stemming the tide of greenwash. *Consumer Policy Review*, 18(3), 79-83 In-text reference: (Gillespie, 2008)
- Gleim, M. R., Smith, J. S., Andrews, D., & Cronin, J. J. (2013). Against the green: A multi-method examination of the barriers to green consumption. *Journal of Retailing*, 89(1), 44–61. doi:10.1016/j.jretai.2012.10.001 In-text reference: Gleim et al., 2013
- Ghassani, M. K., Rahman, N. A., Geraldine, T., & Murwani, I. A. (2022). Retrieved from <https://bircu-journal.com/index.php/birci/article/view/6598> In-text reference: (M.K. Ghassani, 2022)
- Hu, W., & Wall, G. (2005). Environmental Management, environmental image and the competitive tourist attraction. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 13(6), 617–635. doi:10.1080/09669580508668584 In-text reference: (Hu and Wall ,2005)
- Hub, C. (2023). Retrieved from <https://www.breakfreefromplastic.org/2022/06/15/activists-protest-unilevers-massive-plastic-sachet-waste-problem/>
- Horiuchi, R., Schuchard, R., Shea, L., & Townsend, S. (2009). Understanding and preventing greenwash: A business guide. London: Futerra Sustainability Communications, 1-39. In text reference: (Horiuchi & Schuchard,2019)
- ISEAL (2015a) Sustainability Claims - Good Practice Guide. Sustainability Standards Systems' Guide to Developing and Managing Environmental, Social and/or Economic Claims. Version 1.0. ISEAL Alliance, London In-text reference: (ISEAL Alliance, 2015)
- Johansson, S., Lindström, E., & Liu, J. (2020). Retrieved from <https://www.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:1442092/FULLTEXT01.pdf> In-text reference: (S. Johansson et al., 2020)
- Kahraman, A., & Kazançoğlu, İ. (2019). Understanding consumers' purchase intentions toward natural - claimed products: A qualitative research in personal care products. *Business Strategy and the Environment*, 28(6), 1218–1233. doi:10.1002/bse.2312 In-text reference: (Kahraman & Kazançoğlu,2019)

- Kazdin, A. E. (2009). Psychological science's contributions to a sustainable environment: Extending our reach to a grand challenge of society. *American Psychologist*, 64(5), 339–356. doi:10.1037/a0015685 In-text reference: (Kazdin, 2009)
- Kim, N., & Lee, K. (2023). Retrieved from <https://www.mdpi.com/1660-4601/20/7/5312#B19-ijerph-20-05312> In-text reference: (Kim.N & Lee.K, 2023)
- Krafft, J., & Saito, R. (2014). Greenwashing an experimental stud about the effects of misleading and deceptive environmental claims in advertising. Gothenburg: University of Gothenburg. In-text reference (Kraft and Saito,2014)
- Lai, C. K. M., & Cheng, E. W. L. (2016). Green purchase behavior of undergraduate students in Hong Kong. *The Social Science Journal*, 53(1), 67–76. doi:10.1016/j.soscij.2015.11.003 In-text citation: (Lai & Cheng, 2016)
- Lauri, M. A. (2019). WASP (write a scientific paper): Collecting qualitative data using focus groups. *Early Human Development*, 133, 65–68. doi:10.1016/j.earlhumdev.2019.03.015 In-text reference: (Lauri ,2019)
- Lee, K. (2009). A new model for testing green consumer behaviour. *Journal of Consumer Behaviour*, 9(2), 131–149. doi:10.1002/cb.252 In-text reference: (Lee, 2009)
- Li, M. (2020). Review of Consumers' Green Consumption Behavior. *American Journal of Industrial and Business Management*, 10(03), 585–599. doi:10.4236/ajibm.2020.103039 In-text reference : (Li.M.L, 2020)
- Lin, J., Lobo, A., & Leckie, C. (2017). The role of benefits and transparency in shaping consumers' green perceived value, self-brand connection and Brand Loyalty. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 35, 133–141. doi:10.1016/j.jretconser.2016.12.011 In text reference: (lin et al., 2017)
- Martins, A. (2023). Retrieved from <https://www.businessnewsdaily.com/15087-consumers-want-sustainable-products.html> In-text reference: (Martins.A, 2023)
- McDaniel, S. W., & Rylander, D. H. (1993). Strategic green marketing. *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, 10(3), 4–10. doi:10.1108/07363769310041929 In-text reference: Stephen W. McDaniel and David H. Rylander (1993)
- Miller, C. (1990). Use of Environment-friendly Packaging May Take Awhile. *Marketing News*, 18. In text reference: (Miller, 1990)
- Mitchell, V. (1999). Consumer perceived risk: Conceptualisations and Models. *European Journal of Marketing*, 33(1/2), 163–195. doi:10.1108/03090569910249229 In-text reference: (Mitchell, 1999)
- Munuera-Aleman, J. L., Delgado-Ballester, E., & Yague-Guillen, M. J. (2003). Development and validation of a Brand Trust scale. *International Journal of Market Research*, 45(1), 1–18. doi:10.1177/147078530304500103 In-text reference: (Delgado Ballester et al.,2003)
- Neubauer, B. E., Witkop, C. T., & Varpio, L. (2019). How phenomenology can help us learn from the experiences of others. *Perspectives on Medical Education*, 8(2), 90–97. doi:10.1007/s40037-019-0509-2 In-text-reference: (Neubauer et. al., 2019)
- Nguyen, T. T., Yang, Z., Nguyen, N., Johnson, L. W., & Cao, T. K. (2019). Greenwash and green purchase intention: The mediating role of green skepticism. *Sustainability*, 11(9), 2653. doi:10.3390/su11092653 In-text reference : (Nguyen et al., 2019)
- Nyilasy, Gergely, Gangadharbatla, H., & Paladino, A. (2014). Perceived greenwashing: The interactive effects of Green Advertising and corporate environmental performance on consumer reactions. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 125(4), 693–707. doi:10.1007/s10551-013-1944-3 In-text reference: (Nyilasy et al.,2014)
- Oyewole, P. (2001). SICUAK Cists if Environmental Justice Associated with the Practice of Green Marketing. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 29(3), 239–251. doi:10.1023/a:1026592805470 In-text reference: (Oyewole,2001)
- Parguel, B., Benoit-Moreau, F., & Russell, C. A. (2015). Can evoking nature in advertising mislead consumers? the power of 'executional greenwashing'. *International Journal of Advertising*, 34(1), 107–134. doi:10.1080/02650487.2014.996116 In-text reference: (Parguel et al., 2015)
- Paul, J., Modi, A., & Patel, J. (2016a). Predicting green product consumption using theory of planned behavior and reasoned action. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 29, 123–134. doi:10.1016/j.jretconser.2015.11.006 In-text reference: (Paul et al., 2016)

- Paul, J., Modi, A., & Patel, J. (2016b). Predicting green product consumption using theory of planned behavior and reasoned action. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 29, 123–134. doi:10.1016/j.jretconser.2015.11.006 In-text reference: (Paul et al.,2016)
- Prasad, A., & Holzinger, I. (2013). Seeing through smoke and mirrors: A critical analysis of marketing CSR. *Journal of Business Research*, 66(10), 1915–1921. doi:10.1016/j.jbusres.2013.02.013 In-text reference: (Prasad and Holzinger, 2013)
- Rahim, R. A., Sulaiman, Z., Chin, T. A., Baharun, R., & Muharam, F. M. (2016). Measuring electronic word of mouth review adoption on green purchase intention using source credibility theory. *Advanced Science Letters*, 22(12), 4283–4287. doi:10.1166/asl.2016.8129 In-text reference: (Rahim et al., 2016)
- Salehzadeh, R., Sayedan, M., Mirmehdi, S. M., & Heidari Aqagoli, P. (2021). Elucidating green branding among Muslim consumers: The Nexus of Green Brand Love, image, trust and attitude. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 14(1), 250–272. doi:10.1108/jima-08-2019-0169 In-text reference: (Salehzadeh et al., 2021)
- Sallam, M. A. (2016). The impact of Brand Image and corporate branding on CONSUMER'S CHOICE: The role of brand equity. *International Journal of Marketing Studies*, 8(1), 98. doi:10.5539/ijms.v8n1p98 In-text reference: (Sallam, 2016)
- Shmelev, S. (1999). Critical masses: Citizens, nuclear weapons production, and environmental destruction in the United States and Russia, by Russell J. Dalton, Paula Garb, Nicholas P. Lovrich, John C. Pierce and John M. Whitely. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 1999. review by Michael D. Mehta. *Journal of Political Ecology*, 6(1). doi:10.2458/v6i1.21443 In-text reference: (Pierce et al, 1999)
- Schmuck, D., Matthes, J., & Naderer, B. (2018). Misleading consumers with green advertising? an affect–reason–involvement account of greenwashing effects in environmental advertising. *Journal of Advertising*, 47(2), 127–145. doi:10.1080/00913367.2018.1452652 In-text reference: (Schmuck et al., 2018)
- Singh, G., & Pandey, N. (2018). The determinants of green packaging that influence buyers' willingness to pay a price premium. *Australasian Marketing Journal*, 26(3), 221–230. doi:10.1016/j.ausmj.2018.06.001 In-text reference: (Singh and Pandey,2018).
- Slaughter, P. (2008). Avoid the pitfalls of greenwash. *Home Furnishings Business*, 3(2), 32–36. In-text reference: (Slaughter, 2008)
- Soler, C. (2012). Frank-Martin Belz and Ken Peattie: Sustainability Marketing. A global perspective. *Journal of Consumer Policy*, 33(4), 425–426. doi:10.1007/s10603-010-9132-7 In text citation: (Frank-Martin Belz & Ken Peattie, 2012)
- Stall-Meadows, C., & Davey, A. (2013a). Green marketing of apparel: Consumers' price sensitivity to environmental marketing claims. *Journal of Global Fashion Marketing*, 4(1), 33–43. doi:10.1080/20932685.2012.753293 In-text reference: (Celia Stall-Meadows & Anne Davey , 2013)
- Stall-Meadows, C., & Davey, A. (2013b). Green marketing of apparel: Consumers' price sensitivity to environmental marketing claims. *Journal of Global Fashion Marketing*, 4(1), 33–43. doi:10.1080/20932685.2012.753293 In-text reference: (Celia Stall-Meadows & Anne Davey, 2013)
- Szabo, S., & Webster, J. (2020). Perceived greenwashing: The effects of green marketing on environmental and product perceptions. *Journal of Business Ethics*. doi:10.1007/s10551-020-04461-0 In-text reference: (Szabo. S & Webster. J, 2020)
- Tong, A., Flemming, K., McInnes, E., Oliver, S., & Craig, J. (2012). Enhancing transparency in reporting the synthesis of qualitative research: Entreq. *BMC Medical Research Methodology*, 12(1). doi:10.1186/1471-2288-12-181 In-text reference: Tong et. al (2012)
- Urien, B., & Kilbourne, W. (2010). Generativity and self-enhancement values in eco-friendly behavioral intentions and environmentally responsible consumption behavior. *Psychology & Marketing*, 28(1), 69–90. doi:10.1002/mar.20381 In-text reference: (Urien and Kilbourne, 2011)
- Vermeir, I., & Verbeke, W. (2006). Sustainable Food Consumption: Exploring the consumer “attitude – behavioral intention” gap. *Journal of Agricultural and Environmental Ethics*, 19(2), 169–194. doi:10.1007/s10806-005-5485-3 (Vermeir & Verbeke, 2006)

- White, K., Habib, R., & Hardisty, D. J. (2019). How to shift consumer behaviors to be more sustainable: A literature review and guiding framework. *Journal of Marketing*, 83(3), 22–49. doi:10.1177/0022242919825649 In-text reference: (White et al., 2019)
- Welford, R. (1992). Greener Marketing Martin Charter (editor) Greenleaf Publishing Sheffield, 1992. ISBN 1 874719 00 4 hardback £25.00 \$40.00 403 pp. *Business Strategy and the Environment*, 1(3), 51–51. doi:10.1002/bse.3280010308 In text reference: (Charter, M. 1992)
- Wells, R. P. (1990, March 19). Environmental Performance Will Count in the 1990s. *Marketing News*, p. 22. In-text reference: (Wells, 1990)
- Zelezny, L. C., & Schultz, P. W. (2000). Psychology of promoting environmentalism: Promoting environmentalism. *Journal of Social Issues*, 56(3), 365–371. doi:10.1111/0022-4537.00172 In-text referene: (Zelezny & Schultz, 2000)
- Zhang, L., Li, D., Cao, C., & Huang, S. (2018). The influence of greenwashing perception on green purchasing intentions: The mediating role of green word-of-mouth and moderating role of Green Concern. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 187, 740–750. doi:10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.03.201 In-text reference: (Zhang et al.,2018)
- Öztürk, R. (2020). Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/348649689_Green_Marketing In-text reference: (Öztürk, Resul, 2020)